Improving mental health by focusing on the strengths of Aboriginal communities

Laurence J. Kirmayer, MD
Division of Social & Transcultural Psychiatry
McGill University
Culture and Mental Health Research Unit
Jewish General Hospital

Disclosure:
No relevant financial relationships exist.
Welcome to the Network for Aboriginal Mental Health Research (NAMHR) Website

The Network for Aboriginal Mental Health Research (NAMHR) is committed to building capacity for mental health and addictions research and knowledge translation in remote, rural and urban settings by working in close partnership with Aboriginal organizations and communities.

The priority of the Network is to develop research capacity. To that end, the emphasis is on networking and training for existing researchers and conducting a series of pilot projects that provide a basis to seek funding for larger scale projects from other sources including regular CIHR competitions, federal and provincial programs and Aboriginal organizations.

Events for November 2011

Culture and Mental Health Research Unit (CMHRU) Jewish General Hospital

The Culture and Mental Health Research Unit of the Department of Psychiatry, Dr. Mortimer D. Davis-Jewish General Hospital, conducts research on the mental health of indigenous peoples, mental health services for immigrants and refugees, cultural determinants of health behaviours, psychiatry in midwifery, and the anthropology of psychiatry.

Director: Dr. Laurence J. Kirmayer

Investigators

Dr. Danielle Grisaleau (Public Health, Anthropology)
Dr. Jadwiga Guder (Clinical Psychiatry)
Dr. G. Erin Jarvis (Pharmacy)
Dr. Karen Looper (Psychiatry)
Dr. Brett Thomas (Psychology)
Dr. Constantin Tranulis (Psychiatry)
Dr. Ashley Wazana (Child Psychiatry)
Dr. Evelyn Timm (Psychology)

Affiliated Researchers

Dr. Joanna Leahy (Psychiatry, McGill)
Dr. Kelly McKinnon (Humanities, Philosophy and Religion, John Abbott)
Dr. Tabitha Messham (Child Psychiatry, McGill)
Dr. I. Anne Melkus (Child Psychiatry, McGill)
Dr. Natalie Pach (Occupational Therapy, McGill)
Dr. Elizabeth Poulton (Child Psychiatry, McGill)
Dr. Andrew Ryan (Psychology, Connaught University)
Dr. Richard Whiteley (Psychosocial Division, Douglas Hospital Research Center)
Outline

• Strengths and resilience based approaches to mental health and wellness

• The burden of mental health problems among Aboriginal peoples

• Roots of resilience

• Culturally-based, family centred mental health promotion for Aboriginal youth

• Implications for prevention and promotion

What is Mental Wellness?

• Mental health, mental illness and community wellness are concepts reflecting different aspects of well-being.

• Mental health often refers to lay notions such as personal happiness, fulfillment in life, overall well-being and sense of accomplishment or mastery

Mental health is the capacity of each and all of us to feel, think and act in ways that enhance our ability to enjoy life and deal with the challenges we face. It is a positive sense of emotional and spiritual well-being that respects the importance of equity, social justice, interconnections and person dignity.

Joubert and Raeburn (1998; p.16)
WHO “Health For All” / Social Determinants of Health and Wellbeing

- Cohesion: existential values, meaning, self-transcendence
- Control: mastery, participation, self-directedness
- Connectedness: social significance, to care, to be cared for
- Autonomy, integrity, identity, status, dignity

WHO Quality of Life

- psychological dimensions (e.g. memory and self-esteem)
- social relationships
- environment (physical safety and security)
- home environment; financial resources
- availability and quality of health and social care
- opportunities for learning
- participation in recreation and leisure
- spirituality, religion and personal beliefs
### Cultural Concepts of Health and Wellness

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Way of Being</th>
<th>Values</th>
<th>Health</th>
<th>Wellness</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Egocentric</td>
<td>individualism</td>
<td>self-esteem, competence</td>
<td>personal accomplishments</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Sociocentric</td>
<td>familism, collectivism</td>
<td>relationships with others</td>
<td>harmony of family, clan, community</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Ecocentric</td>
<td>ecological balance, exchange</td>
<td>connection to the land</td>
<td>balance in environment</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Cosmocentric</td>
<td>cosmic order</td>
<td>spiritual or religious belief and practice</td>
<td>honoring of ancestors or creator</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>


### Levels & Sources of Resilience

- Physiological systems: homeostasis and healing
- Individual constitution: temperament, personality, strengths and abilities
- Psychological processes: learning and problem solving, regulation of self-esteem, ways of coping
- Relationships: family, social networks, community
- Environment: ecological resilience
- Spirituality or philosophy: meaning and values
Unique Situation of Aboriginal Communities

- complex jurisdictional arrangements result in significant gaps in coverage and ambiguities or conflicts about responsibility;
- diversity of Aboriginal communities in terms of culture, language, geography, lifestyle and the scale and configuration of communities;
- high prevalence of specific types of problems, like suicide or substance abuse
- link between mental health problems and the history of historical trauma, loss and grief stemming from the impact of colonization, residential schools, and forced assimilation
- central importance for communities of maintaining language and cultural identity, values and traditions and directing their own lives.


Transgenerational Effects of Residential Schools

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Enduring psychological, social, and economic effects on Survivors</th>
<th>Devaluing and essentializing Aboriginal identity</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Models of parenting and child rearing based on institutional experiences</td>
<td>Individual and collective disempowerment, loss of control, and lack of efficacy</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Patterns of emotional responsiveness and expression</td>
<td>Disruption of family and kinship networks</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Repetition of physical and sexual abuse</td>
<td>Destruction of communities, nations, or peoples</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Loss of cultural knowledge, language, and tradition</td>
<td>Damage to relationship with larger society</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Undermining individual and collective identity and self-esteem</td>
<td>– popular images, racism, stereotypes, government tutelage and bureaucratic control, and judicial and corrections system</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>– sense of living in a just society</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>


Figure 3
Comparison of the prevalence of suicide ideation and attempts (%), population aged 15 years and over, Nunavik, 1992 and 2004

Suicide ideation/attempts (lifetime), $p < 0.0001$; Suicide ideation/attempts (past 12 months), not significant, $p > 0.05$.
Sources: Nunavik Inuit Health Survey 2004 and Santé Québec survey 1992.
Suicide Rates by Number of Cultural Continuity Factors


Replication, 1993-2000
Lalonde & Chandler

- majority of students attend band-run school
- band-controlled police & fire
- cultural facilities
- band-controlled health services
- history of land claims
- self-government
- advanced stage in land claims negotiation
- women account for more than 50% of elected officials
- band has local child protection services
Alternative Interpretations

• Local control
  - *sense of empowerment, collective self-efficacy & self-esteem*
• Better infrastructure
  - *more activities for youth*
• High level of community organization
  - *order, solidarity & support, power sharing*
• Larger community
  - *buffering effect*
• More economically successful
  - *more opportunities for youth*
• Adaptation/pluralism rather than pure traditionalism

Correlates of Relational Aggression Among Naskapi Youth

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Step and predictor</th>
<th>Multiple R</th>
<th>F</th>
<th>R²</th>
<th>ΔR²</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1. Gender</td>
<td>.23</td>
<td>2.84</td>
<td>.05</td>
<td>.05</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2. Age</td>
<td>.23</td>
<td>1.47</td>
<td>.05</td>
<td>.00</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3. Depression</td>
<td>.26</td>
<td>1.24</td>
<td>.07</td>
<td>.02</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4. Anxiety</td>
<td>.33</td>
<td>3.50</td>
<td>.11</td>
<td>.04</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5. Prosocial skills</td>
<td>.35</td>
<td>3.17</td>
<td>.12</td>
<td>.01</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6. Cultural identity</td>
<td>.54</td>
<td>3.17</td>
<td>.17**</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

* p < .05; ** p < .01

Roots of Resilience: Transformations of Identity and Community in Indigenous Mental Health

Roots of Resilience is a new interdisciplinary collaboration between researchers in Canada and New Zealand to study the factors that promote resilience in mental health among Indigenous people across the lifespan, focusing on the response to risk factors in early childhood, school age children, adolescence and young adulthood.

The aims of the program are to:
- Identify what is distinctive about resilience in Indigenous communities
- Share existing models and methods for research on resilience and assist in their development
- Design and carry out cross-national comparative studies in which the contrast between countries will allow us to identify the role of specific social and cultural factors

Co-Investigators

- Stéphane Dandeneau, PhD, UQAM
- Morgan Phillips, MA, McGill
- Greg Brass, MA, McGill
- Karla Jessen Williamson, PhD, University of Saskatchewan
What is Distinctive about Resilience Among Indigenous Peoples?

- distinct history, identity, culture and values
- specific historical and current challenges or types of adversity against which resilience is recognized
- particular contexts, constraints, and resources
- distinctive psychological and social strategies
- particular types of desirable outcome
KAHNEWAKE: FOCUS GROUPS, MAIN THEMES

- Elders see resilience as being able to survive during tough times (i.e. the depression, loss of riverfront due to the St. Lawrence Seaway). They recognize that we’ve become more educated and self sufficient, and that the language and culture are being revitalized.

- Adults see resilience as a renewal of nationalism, culture, language and ancestral pride, education is important.

- Youth see resilience is struggling with identity, individualism/materialism, and dealing with affects of the tobacco industry.

- Common Themes: “We’re still here!”, The Oka Crisis, the importance of family and extended family, individualism/materialism, effects of colonization, comparing the Holocaust to the history of Indigenous people.

Indigenous Strategies of Resilience

- Connection to land and sense of place as ways of constituting and regulating the ecocentric self

- Recuperation of tradition, language, spirituality, healing as personal and collective resources

- Stories and storytelling as privileged way of knowing and transmitting collective identity

- Political activism as source of collective and individual agency
Culturally-Based, Family-Centred Mental Health Promotion for Aboriginal Youth

- PHAC Innovation program: Kirmayer, Whitbeck, Walls, and others

- Partners: 4 Anishnabe communities (Ontario), Swampy Cree Suicide Prevention Team (Manitoba), Splatsin First Nation (BC), First Nations of Quebec and Labrador Health and Social Services Commission

- McGill, CHU, INSPQ, University of Nebraska-Lincoln, University of Minnesota-Duluth, UQAM, University of Manitoba, Saskatchewan

- 15-session program for youth and their families

- package designed to help communities develop their own version

- network to support implementation
Intervention Origins

- First family-centered culturally based substance use prevention was developed for 7th-8th grade students at three U.S. reservations in the mid-1990s
- Based on Richard Spoth’s Strengthening Families Program
  - Completely revised and culturally adapted, but kept some of the same basic constructs
- Revised via NIDA grant
  - Based on research findings lowered ages to 3rd and 4th graders
  - Added cultural content & more sessions
- Has been adapted for use by Lakota, Navajo, Pueblo Nations.
  - Used on Minnesota and Wisconsin reservations with state and tribal support
- Current PHAC funding to expand content for mental health promotion and adaptation to other Indigenous cultures.
**Culture-Specific Assessment & Intervention Strategy**

**Stage 1**
- Invitation from community and cultural identification of prevention focus

**Stage 2**
- Cultural identification of risk and protective factors

**Stage 3**
- Cultural translation of risk and protective factors

**Stage 4**
- Next Generation Culturally Specific Intervention Trial and Assessments

---

**Evaluation Strategy: PHAC Project**

- Mixed-Method Evaluation at 4 levels
  - Program
    - Process of engagement and implementation
    - Process of cultural adaptation
  - Individual-level
    - Positive mental health
    - Psychological distress, substance use, suicidality
    - Program-specific measures (e.g., help-seeking, intergenerational interactions)
  - Family/Peer level
    - Family experiences, activities
    - Capture "spillover" effects to other members of families or peers
  - Community level:
    - Community-level baseline & post-program data on mental health
    - Participant reports of community engagement, empowerment
Challenges

- Geographic distance between partners, communities
- Much demand on human resources in communities
- Approach is a primary prevention program and mental health promotion; communities hope for more services and targeted interventions with immediate impact (e.g., this often ends up being "postvention")
- Program content must address the internal diversity of communities
  - Divergent community views on the extent to which their should be a focus on emotionally traumatic issues, historical trauma, family violence
  - Diverse perspectives on culture, identity, religion, and spirituality
  - Political dilemmas of codying and measuring “culture” as a product
- Intervention aims to be broad but must achieve sufficient “dose” to be effective

- Strategy: Vary specific content across sites, retain key constructs

Opportunities

- The multisite program provides an opportunity to learn about processes of cultural adaptation and implementation
- We will be able to compare approaches/processes across sites and build those differences into evaluation strategies (variations on CBPR)
- Innovative, multi-level, multi-method evaluation
- Will result in toolkits that can be used in flexible ways by communities
- Aim to build a network that can support future knowledge exchange across communities
Key Issues

• (i) the practical dilemmas posed by serving many small communities that are remote from urban centres;

• (ii) the pervasive impact of the history of collective trauma and loss;

• (iii) the key role of cultural identity in community revitalization and in insuring the safety and competence of health services; and

• (iv) the central role of community engagement, empowerment and governance in strengthening mental health and wellbeing.
Challenges in Rural and Remote Areas

- shortage of trained professionals or other helpers
- time pressure on workers living in a small community
- emotional demands of working in one's own community
- difficulty of ensuring confidentiality in small communities
- stigma associated with mental illness that is difficult to conceal in small communities
- costs and troubles associated with transportation of providers or patients
- health professionals pressure to function as generalists, accommodating a wide variety of clinical problems.

Community-Based Resources & Healing

- community members own and define their problems and solutions;
- the project employs local people and trains them in community development skills and processes;
- a local committee is established and actively participates in all aspects of the community development process;
- trusting, respectful partnerships between Aboriginal community members and resource people, agencies and providers are developed and maintained
- adequate resources are available both within and outside the community;
- there is an adequate level of pre-existing community capacity and a context that supports local involvement and continuity in promoting health.
Problems in Service Delivery

• Services are provided only in reaction to crises; fewer resources are invested in primary and secondary prevention or health promotion activities.

• Services are segmented, fragmented and lack continuity of care over time and across sectors.

• Financial sustainability of projects is uncertain; promising and innovative health care projects are terminated just as communities are becoming more comfortable with the intervention.

Areas of Focus

• 1. Focus on children, young people, families and communities

• 2. Develop Aboriginal community controlled health and wellness services

• 3. Improve access and responsiveness of mental health care

• 4. Coordination of resources, programs, initiatives and planning
1. Focus on children, young people, and families

- Develop and implement programs that strengthen maternal and child health programs, with a focus on culturally appropriate family and parenting skills.

- Disseminate age-appropriate assessment and intervention strategies children and young people at risk of mental health and related problems.

- Support community development programs that build on the capacity of local communities to respond to the needs of children. These may include educational, recreational and cultural programs targeting youth that focus on the healthy development of individuals through their teenage years into adulthood.

2. Develop Aboriginal Community Controlled Health Services

- Build a skilled group of mental health workers able to provide mental health and social and emotional well being services within the Aboriginal community controlled health services.

- Provide optimal resources to community mental health centres and teams to deliver flexible social and emotional wellness programs and needs based care that incorporate traditional and more culturally appropriate approaches to healing.

- Develop, implement and monitor strategies to recruit, retain and support Aboriginal workers, organizers and administrators in the promotion of mental health and social and emotional well-being.
3. Improve access and responsiveness of mental health care

- Identify, monitor and disseminate information about effective models of services and partnership that improve service responsiveness to Aboriginal peoples in partnership with NAHO and other organizations.
- Support training at universities and professional programs for all health and social service professionals on Aboriginal mental health issues.
- Provide training for primary care clinicians in Aboriginal mental health issues.
- Provide in-service training for all non-Indigenous mental health workers in the knowledge, skills and attitudes required to meet the needs of Aboriginal patients and their families.
- Provide cultural safety training for administrators and planners, so they, in turn, can build this into organizational and institutional practice.
- Develop strategies to encourage psychiatrists, psychologists and other mental health professionals to work in Aboriginal communities.
- Increase the numbers of Aboriginal mental health worker positions and provide appropriate on the job support and supervision.

4. Coordination of resources, programs, initiatives and planning

- Improve linkages across all services and sectors to ensure collaborative responses and needs-based mental health care.
- Provide funding that enables Aboriginal community controlled health services to more flexibly deliver mental health and social emotional well being programs.
- Increase funding to Aboriginal community controlled health services to operate mental health and wellbeing programs.
- Develop strategies to improve the accountability of mainstream services for the delivery of culturally safe and competent mental health services for Aboriginal peoples.
- Improve coordination, planning and monitoring mechanisms.
- Form regional/local level implementation groups between service providers to coordinate service delivery across mental health, Aboriginal community health Services, substance use, and primary care services.
Evaluation

- engage stakeholders (team members, other health practitioners, community workers, clients and families as well as policy makers and planners);
- develop a detailed description of the program as it is actually functioning (including staffing, training, implementation, and service delivery);
- focus the evaluation on key elements chosen on the basis of their relevance to stakeholder priorities and to filling the gaps in existing evidence;
- gather evidence in a rigorous way, using external evaluation and triangulation with multiple methods;
- interpret the evidence systematically to establish empirically justified conclusions; and
- insure knowledge transfer to community stakeholders and others through the use of varied, culturally appropriate methods.